
THINKING SKILLS

9694/23

Paper 2 Critical Thinking

May/June 2014

1 hour 45 minutes

Additional Materials: Answer Booklet/Paper

READ THESE INSTRUCTIONS FIRST

If you have been given an Answer Booklet, follow the instructions on the front cover of the booklet.

Write your Centre number, candidate number and name on all the work you hand in.

Write in dark blue or black pen.

Do not use staples, paper clips, glue or correction fluid.

DO NOT WRITE IN ANY BARCODES.

Answer **all** the questions.

Start each question on a new answer sheet.

At the end of the examination, fasten all your work securely together.

The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question.

This document consists of **6** printed pages and **2** blank pages.

- 1 Study the evidence and answer the questions that follow.

Source A**Newspaper report**

Many guests at the wedding party of local Bahan businessman, Mr Dev Singh, experienced stomach upsets and nausea the day after the event. Mr Singh, who runs a chain of restaurants, is distraught as he used his own staff to cater for the party. "I cannot understand it," he said, "My staff are trained to the highest level. Whatever caused this, I cannot believe it was a lapse of food hygiene by my staff."

Source B**Statement**

by wedding guest

There were enormous amounts of food and drink at the party. I didn't have too much as I had to fly out early the following day to a business meeting. I felt a bit queasy the next morning but it soon wore off and it didn't affect me very much. I know that other guests were really quite unwell and had to stay in bed for a couple of days.

Source C**Statement**

by Event Manager

Since I manage Mr Singh's staff every day, I know them well and am sure they prepared the food to their usual high standard. It was a hot day but all food was kept cool. The problem with these 'serve-yourself' buffets is that people over-indulge and mix foods in an unwise way. A buffet allows people choice but they do not always know what is good for them.

Source D**Statement**

by worker at the event

The agency rang me up and asked if I was available that day to do a wedding party which was short of staff because of sickness. I told them I had never done this sort of work before, but the agency said this wouldn't be a problem because serving up food didn't require any special skill.

Source E**Statement**

by wedding guest

The catering was rather chaotic with long queues at the buffet. People were piling up their plates with all sorts of different food because they didn't want to have to queue again – I saw one guy with prawns and ice cream. I was rather surprised, as it was Mr Singh's own staff and I would have thought he would want to create a good impression. I don't think many people will be going to his restaurants after this.

Source F**Announcement**

by Bahan Power Company

We would like to apologise for the widespread power cuts yesterday. This was because a fuse in an important electricity sub-station had blown. Power was restored by our engineers in two hours so we hope customers were not unduly inconvenienced.

- (a) How useful is the evidence in Source B in deciding the reason why guests were ill? [3]
- (b) How significant is the evidence in Source D? [3]
- (c) How relevant is the information in Source E? [3]
- (d) How likely is it that the guests at Mr Singh's wedding became ill due to poor food hygiene? Write a short, reasoned argument to support your conclusion, with critical reference to the evidence provided and considering plausible alternative scenarios. [6]

2 Study the evidence and answer the questions that follow.

Source A

Extract

from *'So You Think Ships Have Got Safer?'* by Dick Moby

The capsizing of the cruise ship Costa Concordia off an Italian island in January 2012 led to many people drawing parallels with the sinking of the Titanic in April 1912. The Titanic was said to be unsinkable. Nevertheless, it did have lifeboats, which is rather curious if it really was believed by the owners to be unsinkable. In both cases problems with launching lifeboats contributed greatly to the chaos and confusion of abandoning ship.

Many more passengers survived after the Costa Concordia incident than in the case of the Titanic. However, this was due more to the different circumstances rather than any improvement in evacuation techniques. The Titanic sank to the bottom of the deep, ice-cold waters of the North Atlantic ocean, hundreds of miles from rescue and land. The Concordia was so close to the coast that some passengers managed to swim to shore and was in the warmer waters of the Mediterranean sea. It also only capsized and did not sink, meaning a number of passengers were able to escape down the hull of the boat hours after it came to rest. If the Concordia had hit an iceberg in the North Atlantic miles out to sea then the loss of life would have been similar to that of the Titanic disaster.

Source B

Editorial

from *'Shipping News'*

Many experienced mariners have commented that the Costa Concordia incident – particularly the problems encountered in accessing and launching lifeboats as the ship tilted to one side – proves there are still problems in evacuating ships that the industry has yet to solve.

The safety regulations assume that untrained and frightened passengers will be able to deal with lifeboats – including the possibility of having to board them from the water. The problems are compounded by the difficulty, if not impossibility, of launching lifeboats from the 'high' side of a tilting ship. After the Titanic disaster, all ships must have 125% capacity in lifeboats, but this is inadequate if the lifeboats on one side of the ship are unusable.

In the case of giant cruise ships like the Concordia, this problem is compounded by the sheer numbers involved: 4200 passengers and crew, compared to 2200 on the Titanic.

Source C

Extract

from officer's manual *'Emergencies At Sea'*

Staging a rehearsal of a ship evacuation is expensive and difficult to organise, and the circumstances bear little resemblance to what would happen in a true, emergency-driven evacuation where specific and unanticipated problems will be encountered. A key difficulty is that, once the ship tilts, corridors are turned into steep shafts which are very hard to climb up. So it is difficult for crew and passengers to prepare for abandoning a ship.

Source D**Letter**

from a regular cruise ship passenger to shipping company

There are 2 problems with using lifeboats:

- they are difficult to launch because they are very high above the water;
- there are not enough of them because the ship usually tilts to one side, meaning the lifeboats on the 'high' side cannot be launched.

The solutions to these problems are obvious. Put the lifeboats lower and have 100% capacity on each side.

- (a) Suggest **one** possible explanation for why the Titanic carried lifeboats even though it was thought to be unsinkable (Source A). [2]
- (b) "If the Concordia had hit an iceberg in the North Atlantic miles out to sea then the loss of life would have been similar to that of the Titanic disaster." (Source A.) Is this conclusion reliable? Justify your answer. [3]
- (c) Suggest a problem with **each** of the solutions offered in Source D. [4]
- (d) 'Problems with evacuating large passenger ships are mainly caused by difficulties in loading and launching lifeboats.'

How justified is this statement? Write a short, reasoned argument to support your conclusion, using and evaluating the information provided in Sources A–D. [6]

3 Read the passage and answer the questions below.

- 1 People used to go shopping in order to purchase goods such as food and clothes. For people who had an income beyond what was needed to purchase necessities, some of this shopping was to buy things they wanted rather than needed. It would not be true to say that people only used to buy essentials in the past. However, the modern shopping mall has moved 'shopping' in a new and sinister direction. It is more a branch of the entertainment industry, employing many thousands of people.
- 2 It is clear that the shopping mall aims to be rather more than just a collection of shops. The West Edmonton mall in North America, for instance, offers 110 restaurants, 19 theatres, a five-acre water park and a lake where one can view sharks, octopuses, tropical marine life and a replica of the Great Barrier Reef from a submarine. This clearly places the mall in the entertainment sphere. As such, it has lost sight of its primary function.
- 3 These malls are an essential part of the modern culture of escape through consumption. They provide an artificial environment where people are protected from both the physical and social elements of the real world. They can forget their troubles, at least until the credit card bill comes in.
- 4 The mall sustains the illusory world of celebrity that television creates. This is why everybody wants to be famous these days. Watching a 'soap' and buying a tee-shirt are connected through the world of advertising – one leads to the other. So, the individual's experience in the mall is shaped and controlled as much as it is when watching television.
- 5 We need to return to the pre-mall world of the 'high street'. It is sad to see the decline of the great department stores. A trip to one of these establishments was an all-embracing experience. One could enjoy magnificent displays in the windows and round the day off with tea in the restaurant.

- (a) Using the exact words from the passage as far as possible, identify the main conclusion. [2]
- (b) Using the exact words from the passage as far as possible, identify **three** reasons used to support the main conclusion. [3]
- (c) Evaluate the strength of the reasoning in the argument. In your answer you should consider any flaws, unstated assumptions and other weaknesses. [5]
- (d) 'It is better to shop online than to go to actual shops.'

Write your own short argument to support **or** challenge this claim. The conclusion of your argument must be stated. [5]

BLANK PAGE

Permission to reproduce items where third-party owned material protected by copyright is included has been sought and cleared where possible. Every reasonable effort has been made by the publisher (UCLES) to trace copyright holders, but if any items requiring clearance have unwittingly been included, the publisher will be pleased to make amends at the earliest possible opportunity.

Cambridge International Examinations is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group. Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.